



**Atatürk University**  
Faculty of Veterinary Medicine

2024

# *Re-Visitation* Self Evaluation Report

▶ *for the European Association of Establishments for Veterinary Education (EAEVE)*



*This RSER was prepared according to the instructions in the ESEVT SOP  
Zagreb General Assembly held in May 2019 valid for the Erzurum Re-Visitation*

**23-25 April 2024**





## **CONTENTS**

INTRODUCTION.....	3
1. CORRECTION OF MAJOR DEFICIENCIES.....	8
1.1. Major Deficiency 1.....	8
1.2. Major Deficiency 2.....	9
1.3. Major Deficiency 3.....	10
1.4. Major Deficiency 4.....	10
1.5. Major Deficiency 5.....	11
1.6. Major Deficiency 6.....	11
1.7. Major Deficiency 7.....	12
2. CORRECTION OF MINOR DEFICIENCIES.....	16
2.1. Minor Deficiency 1.....	16
2.2. Minor Deficiency 2.....	16
2.3. Minor Deficiency 3.....	17
2.4. Minor Deficiency 4.....	17
2.5. Minor Deficiency 5.....	18
2.6. Minor Deficiency 6.....	18
2.7. Minor Deficiency 7.....	19
2.8. Minor Deficiency 8.....	19
2.9. Minor Deficiency 9.....	20
3. ESEVT INDICATORS.....	24
4. LIST OF ANNEXES.....	26
ABBREVIATIONS.....	28



T.C.  
ATATÜRK  
ÜNİVERSİTESİ  
1957



## **INTRODUCTION**

Due to the high potential of animal population of Erzurum city, Faculty of Veterinary Medicine of Atatürk University (FVMATAU) was established in 30 May 1997, and resume education in year 2000 cycle.

FVMATAU is a member of “The Association for the Evaluation and Accreditation of Veterinary Institutes and Programs of Veterinary Medicine (VEDEK)” which is the national accreditation unit of veterinary education in Türkiye. It has been fully accredited by VEDEK for five years, March 05, 2022 to February 14, 2027 (Annex 1).

Atatürk University has been fully accredited by the Higher Education Quality Board (YÖKAK) until 2026 (Annex 2). Atatürk University was also selected among the top 20 universities designated as “Research University” among 131 state universities, based on a result of the performance evaluation by YÖK (Annex 3). FVMATAU continuously ranked 1<sup>st</sup> in years 2022, 2023 and 2024 among 28 faculties in Türkiye Times Higher Education (THE) for overall (Annex 4).

At the 23rd General Assembly (Vienna, Austria, May 2010) the FVMATAU unanimously accepted as a member of EAEVE. The first on site visitation of the FVMATAU by the EAEVE was done on November 15 to 19, 2021. The first full visitation of the European System of Evaluation of Veterinary Training (ESEVT) team indicated some areas worthy of praise with 7 major and 9 minor deficiencies and some substandard. The final report was issued by the European Committee of Veterinary Education (ECOVE) on 30 March 2022.

The exit presentation of the visitation team was explained to head of divisions of the Faculty. After, the Dean informed University Rectorate, all academic staff and students about the final report and the decision of the ECOVE. Major and minor deficiencies have been evaluated in a serial Faculty Council meeting. Separate commissions were established for each of the major deficiencies in order to follow up and correct them (Annex 5). After the visitation, the Faculty worked intensively on the identified deficiencies and began to address the deficiencies in accordance with the ESEVT standards.

We are encouraged by the praise and positive comments indicated in the final EAEVE Visit Report. Considering the Visiting Team’s comments and suggestions, significant improvements have been made to enhance the students’ hands-on training experience. We feel that the revisions and changes made since EAEVE’s last visit have significantly improved our Organization’s compliance with the ESEVT Standards. Therefore, we are optimistic that our Organization is close to “ACREDITATION” status by the ESEVT Revisit Team.

Details of the revisions and amendments performed to address both the major and minor deficiencies have been explained in this Re-Visitation Self-Evaluation Report.



## **The Major Deficiencies :**

1. Non-compliance with Substandard 3.1.3 because the curriculum does not allow sufficient acquisition of Day One Competences in Clinical Sciences in companion animals (including equine and exotic pets).

2. Non-compliance with Substandard 3.1.4 because the curriculum does not allow sufficient acquisition of Day One Competencies in Clinical Sciences in food-producing animals (including Animal Production and Herd Health Management).

3. Partial compliance with Substandard 4.3 because the core clinical teaching facilities do not offer sufficient education support for best husbandry, management, biosafety and biosecurity, and animal welfare practices.

4. Non-compliance with Substandard 4.5 because the students do not have access to all required diagnostic and therapeutic facilities (i.e., anesthesia, intensive/critical care, ophthalmology, etc.).

5. Non-compliance with Substandard 4.6 because the isolation facilities do not meet the need for containment of animals with communicable diseases.

6. Non-compliance with Substandard 5.1 because the number and variety of healthy and diseased animals, cadavers, and material of animal origin is not adequate for providing the practical and safe hands-on training to students.

7. Non-compliance with Substandard 9.2 because of insufficient numbers of teaching and technical and support staff.

## **The Minor Deficiencies:**

1. Partial compliance with Substandard 3.1.6 because suboptimal acquisition of understanding and use of principles of clinical governance, and practice evidence-based veterinary medicine.

2. Partial compliance with Substandard 4.4. because research-based and evidence-based clinical training is sub-optimal.

3. Partial compliance with Substandard 4.7 because not all, but only volunteer students, can practise field veterinary medicine and Herd Health Management under academic supervision within the ambulatory clinic.

4. Partial compliance with substandard 4.9 because of sub-optimal delivery of biosafety and biosecurity in all departments.

5. Partial compliance with Substandard 5.3 because not under all circumstances students are active participants in the clinical workup of patients.

6. Partial compliance with Substandard 7.2 because the number of students admitted is sub-optimally consistent with the resources available at the VEE for staff, buildings, equipment, healthy and diseased animals, and materials of animal origin.

7. Partial compliance with Substandard 8.5 because of a sub-optimal implementation of Day One Competencies in the assessment of clinical skills.

8. Partial compliance with Substandard 9.3 because the balance of the workload of teaching, research and service and the rewarding system for teaching excellence are sub-optimal.

9. Partial compliance with Substandard 9.4 because the program for professional growth and development of academic and support staff is sub-optimal.

## WHAT HAS CHANGED IN FVMATAU SINCE THE LAST VISITATION

No	CHANGES
1	FVMATAU has been fully accredited by VEDEK until 2027 (Annex 1).
2	Atatürk University has been fully accredited by YÖKAK until 2026 (Annex 2) and was selected among the top 20 universities designated as “Research University” by YÖK (Annex 3).
3	Updates on the curriculum were made according to EAEVE, VEDEK and Veterinary Medicine National Core Education Program (VUÇEP) criteria and implemented as of 2020. All classes began to pursue on this curriculum as of the 2022-2023 academic year. The learning outcomes of each course were clearly linked to their Day One Competence. Distribution of lectures and their credits were balanced (Annex 6).
4	Applied Training Principles were prepared and put into practice in the spring semester of the 2021-2022 academic year (Annex 7).
5	The Quality Commission (QC) and Education and Training Commission (ETC) have been appointed for monitoring and revision on the achievement of the accepted learning outcomes.
6	The FVMATAU biosafety directive, which is applied in all departments/units, has been revised. Also the FVMATAU biosecurity guidelines, including student laboratory usage, as well as waste management plan were updated (Annex 8.1., 8.2., 8.3).
7	The physical conditions of the operation rooms in the animal hospital (windows, floors and inaccessible area control doors) were made compatible with biosecurity.
8	The physical conditions of the hospitalization rooms for horses and large ruminants in the animal hospital (reduction of windows and change of floor drains) were made suitable for animal welfare and biosecurity.
9	Arrangements were made in the animal hospital quarantine rooms to meet the need to keep animals infected with communicable diseases.
10	The physical conditions (paddocks floors) of GHUAM’s Cattle and Sheep farms have been made suitable for animal welfare and biosecurity.
11	Student toilets have been completely renovated (including tile, sinks, toilets and waste water systems).
12	Non-university funding was provided from TÜBİTAK and other organizations. 16 research projects were implemented, many of which involve undergraduate and graduate students.
13	FVMATAU ranked 1 <sup>st</sup> in years 2021, 2022, 2023 and 2024 among the top 28 faculties in Türkiye “Times Higher Education (THE)” for overall.







# CORRECTION OF MAJOR DEFICIENCIES



## 1. CORRECTION OF MAJOR DEFICIENCIES

**1.1. Major Deficiency 1:** Non-compliance with Substandard 3.1.3 because the curriculum does not allow sufficient acquisition of Day One Competences in Clinical Sciences in companion animals (including equine and exotic pets).

### 1.1.1. Factual Information

The curriculum was re-considered to correct substandard 3.1.3. The study was based on VEDEK, VUÇEP and EAEVE criteria and started to be implemented in all classes in the autumn term of the 2021-2022 academic year. Education committee updated the curriculum in terms of theoretical and practical course hours (Annex 6) in the 2022-2023 academic year. Learning outcomes by the course matched with the Day One Qualifications.

Application Guidelines were prepared for the applied courses offered by all departments (including clinical applications) within the scope of the Principles of Applied Education, starting in the spring semester of the 2021-2022 academic year. In accordance with these guidelines, the practices to be carried out by students in compulsory clinical rotations and applied courses and the number of these practices were determined. These practice activities are recorded and monitored digitally through the ÖBS / E-VET system with “practice tracking forms” or manually for some courses. Thus, the type and number of all activities are monitored to achieve the First Day Competences (Annex 9). For students who cannot attend the practical course, make-ups are provided in the following weeks or in the last week of the semester.

In order to enable students to see more patients, cases and materials in clinical and practical courses, more visitations are done to farms in rural areas (including horses) within the scope of Mobile Animal Clinic studies. For this purpose, a new project involving equine are implemented as in those involving ruminants.

Clinical courses are compulsory courses in our curriculum and are carried out by the relevant departments on a rotation. The “Introduction to Clinic” course in the 6<sup>th</sup> semester is given in the form of rotational trainings by the departments of obstetrics and gynaecology, internal medicine, and surgery. Clinic I, II, and III courses are given in the form of rotational trainings by the departments of obstetrics and gynaecology, andrology and artificial insemination, internal medicine, and surgery. Students receive a total of 350 hours of “Practical Training” in the Introduction to Clinic, Clinic I, II and III courses. In addition, the “Undergraduate Residency Training” course in the 10<sup>th</sup> semester is also carried out in the form of compulsory rotation, and students take a total of 424 hours of practice courses from the departments of obstetrics and gynaecology, andrology and artificial insemination, internal medicine, and surgery. The number of applications to be performed

on farm animals and exotic animals in the clinical practice courses that students take from the 6<sup>th</sup> semester onwards has been determined by the relevant departments and recorded in the practice guides. In order to follow up these courses, a coordinator is determined by the Faculty Board at the beginning of the semester. The course coordinator prepares the clinical rotation programs at the beginning of each semester and announces them to the relevant departments. The coordinator determines the evaluation method of the courses and monitors the organisation of the exams.

**1.2. Major Deficiency 2:** Non-compliance with Substandard 3.1.4 because the curriculum does not allow sufficient acquisition of Day One Competences in Clinical Sciences in food-producing animals (including Animal Productions and Herd Health Management).

### 1.2.1. Factual Information

In the curriculum of our faculty, clinical education/practice of students for all animal species starts with the "Introduction to Clinic course (1 hour theoretical, 3 hours practice) from the 6th semester (Annex 6). A and B sections were formed in all classes to reduce the number of students in compulsory rotation to optimal levels. In addition, "Pre-Clinical Internship" started at the end of the 6th semester (Annex 10).

The curriculum of our faculty is largely similar to the curricula of the faculties providing veterinary education in the country level (including other faculties accredited by EAEVE) in accordance with VUÇEP, VEDEK and EAEVE standards. "Herd Health, Management and Economics" course is included in the curriculum.

Practical trainings of animal husbandry related courses are given at the university farm and private farms. Clinical training is also provided at VTH, the university farm and many farms within the scope of Mobile Clinic service.

Students participate in routine Herd Health and Management programs in the on-farm application of animal husbandry and clinical courses. Students also undertake routine herd health planning, control and prevention of infectious and parasitic diseases during their shifts at the university farm. All activities are recorded and evaluated.

**1.3. Major Deficiency 3:** Non-compliance with Substandard 4.3 because the core clinical teaching facilities do not offer sufficient education support for best husbandry, management, biosafety and biosecurity, and animal welfare practices.



### 1.3.1. Factual Information

The changes/improvements made in the units are as follow:

- A hospitalization unit for all animal species and isolated hospitalization units for small and large animals were constructed.
- The necessary equipment for emergency clinics and isolation units was established and served starting from January 1, 2022.
- New automatic doors were installed for biosecurity in the small animal operation area. Windows and waste drainages in the operating theatres were closed.
- A reanimation unit was created after surgical procedures for small and large animals.
- The ventilation system of the operating theatres become functional. The outlet for circulating air was created.
- Students were allowed access to the E-VET system (the electronic recording system used for patients) as well as patient record files.
- The biosafety guidelines and waste management plan were updated and the documents are available on the website (Annex 8.1,8.2, 8.3).
- After the full visit, two "Biosafety Trainings" were given by the experts.
- The course "Biosafety and Occupational Health in Veterinary Medicine" was introduced in the first semester of the curriculum (Annex 6). During the teaching of this course, students are informed about the Biosafety Guidelines and Waste Management Plan available on the website.

**1.4. Major Deficiency 4:** Non-compliance with Substandard 4.5 because the students do not have access to all required diagnostic and therapeutic facilities (i.e., anaesthesia, intensive/critical care, ophthalmology, etc.).

#### 1.4.1. Factual Information

Necropsy course was added to the curriculum as 1 hour theoretical and 4 hours practical compulsory course (Annex 6). The number of compulsory necropsies that students should attend on the basis of species for the First Day Competences was determined (Annex 11) and the practices are recorded.

Anaesthesia and Reanimation course is given in the 7th semester and Emergency Medicine course is given in the 8<sup>th</sup> semester (Annex 6). Students participate in anaesthesia practices in Clinical I, II, III and Undergraduate Residency Training courses. The Departments of

Internal Medicine and Surgery, which covers intensive care subject and related topics, teach the Emergency Medicine course. Practices for Intensive Care and Ophthalmology courses are carried out in Clinical I, II, III and Undergraduate Residency Training courses. Within the scope of these courses in the curriculum, our students gain all the theoretical and practical skills required in diagnosis and treatment that also emphasizes anaesthesia, intensive care and ophthalmology.

Necessary measures were taken to ensure that the number of emergency interventions and hospitalization hours for reaching optimal levels. As of 01 January 2022, patients were admitted to the Emergency Clinic.

**1.5. Major Deficiency 5:** Non-compliance with Substandard 4.6 because the isolation facilities do not meet the need for containment of animals with communicable diseases.

#### **1.5.1. Factual Information**

Necessary equipment of isolation facilities was provided. Necessary arrangements have been made to keep animals in isolation facilities that prevent contact. Written protocols and visible warning signs were prepared. Measures were taken for 24-hour hospitalization of animals with infectious diseases.

Efforts were made to improve clinical practice at the VTH to ensure that students have adequate access to diagnostic and therapeutic facilities, as described in "1.1.1. Factual Information" (see 1.1.1. Information last paragraph).

All devices used for diagnosis and treatment, including ultrasonography, are used by the academic staff in clinical disciplines. Trainings for these personnel were obtained from other competent institutions outside the faculty.

**1.6. Major Deficiency 6:** Non-compliance with Substandard 5.1 because the number and variety of healthy and diseased animals, cadavers, and material of animal origin is not adequate for providing the practical and safe hands-on training to students.

#### **1.6.1. Factual Information**

As mentioned in 1.4.1, the number of mandatory necropsies per species for graduation was determined (Annex 11). In order to increase the number of live and dead animals for educational purposes and to bring these cases to the faculty, co-operation was established with the surrounding veterinary clinics, farms and animal shelters (Annex 12). The number of necropsies was increased in all species and these data were recorded regularly. In order to increase the number of diagnostic necropsies, a faculty member was assigned as a coordinator to ensure coordination between the veterinary pathology unit and the VTH (Annex 13).



After necropsy, some cadavers without suspected infectious diseases are sent to the anatomy unit for training. To ensure sufficient pathological cases in all species and to determine the number of necropsies to be performed by each student before graduation, digital follow-up is carried out through ÖBS. Students upload their necropsy findings, pictures and observations to ÖBS.

The yearly differences in the number of ruminant patients are due to the fact that the costs of diagnostic and treatment services in VTH and rural areas are covered by various organizations such as TANAP, DAP and BAP. The number of sick animals (including horses) examined and treated in VTH and rural farms in the last four years continues to increase, As a result of the projects prepared within the scope of these funds. Thus, students have access to rural cases outside of the faculty. In 2023, a BAP-supported project was implemented to enable students to see especially horse cases at horse farms, with diagnostic expenses covered by our organization (Annex 14.1, 14.2). Compulsory participation of students in mobile clinics was ensured (Annex 15).

Within the scope of animal husbandry, co-operation protocols were prepared for poultry farms and sheep farms in the field, and students are given practices on farms within the scope of the protocols (Annex 16).

**1.7. Major Deficiency 7:** Non-compliance with Substandard 9.2 because of insufficient numbers of teaching and technical and support staff.

#### **1.7.1. Factual Information**

The status of academic and administrative staff appointed and promoted after the full visit is explained in Annex 17. In this context, 7 Professors, 10 Associate Professors, 15 Assistant Professors and 10 Research Assistants have been appointed since the full visit. In addition, 1 Veterinary Surgeon and 3 Veterinary Technicians were also appointed.

We have 88 academic staff in our faculty: 28 Professors, 20 Associate Professors, 19 Assistant Professors and 20 Research Assistants (Annex 18). In addition, one professor was appointed from Fırat University for Ethics and Veterinary History courses and one professor from Selçuk University for Animal Health Economics and Business Administration courses. FVMATAU is in a good position among the faculties in Turkey in terms of academic, technical and support staff. All academic staff (including Research Assistants) have been appointed to permanent positions.

In our country, the minimum infrastructure (physical and technical), minimum human resources (academic, administrative and technical staff), minimum conditions, general and specific principles regarding the quantity and quality of education are specified in

the guideline for starting and continuing education in Veterinary Faculties (Annex 19). The opening and appointment of new academic staff at our university is carried out transparently in accordance with the current legislation.

The academic staff demands by the departments are discussed in the faculty, university and YÖK boards and the recruitment procedures are carried out based on the decisions. In all three boards, in line with the legislation, the number of academic staff, teaching capacity, work and course load are considered in the decision. Applications for the advertised positions are open to everyone. Applications that meet the criteria of the appointment and promotion directive are submitted to the jury evaluation. Jury reports are discussed in the board of directors and appointment procedures are carried out.

In case of compulsory faculty member needs in the departments (in case of faculty members' retirement, health or maternity leave), there is a legal regulation to ensure the assignment of personnel within the scope of inter-institutional cooperation in accordance with Article 40-b of the Higher Education Law No. 2547 (Annex 20).







# CORRECTION OF MINOR DEFICIENCIES



## **2. CORRECTION OF MINOR DEFICIENCIES**

**2.1. Minor Deficiency 1:** Partial compliance with Substandard 3.1.6 because suboptimal acquisition of understanding and use of principles of clinical governance, and practice evidence-based veterinary medicine.

### **2.1.1. Factual Information**

As mentioned in 1.3.1, students can fully participate in the clinical examinations of patients and can also access the E-VET system, which is the electronic recording system used for patients, and have access to the files. For this purpose, all students taking clinical practice courses were trained on the E-VET system. Diagnosis and treatment opportunities are offered to students through VTH, university farms, private farms and mobile clinics.

Since all students have the right to do Extra-mural Practical Training (EPT) (2 internships) for a total of 10 weeks (50 working days) in institutions, organizations and clinics in Turkey and abroad in line with the "Principles of Practical Training" (Annex 10), they have the opportunity to acquire professional knowledge.

**2.2. Minor Deficiency 2:** Partial compliance with Substandard 4.4. because research-based and evidence-based clinical training is sub-optimal.

### **2.2.1. Factual Information**

New personnel were assigned to the emergency clinic. Necessary medical equipment and diagnostic devices were provided for the emergency unit and services are provided at an optimal level. Great progress has been made in terms of making clinical education evidence and research based. Laparoscopic, endoscopic, radiological and well-equipped VTH central laboratory and the facilities of microbiology, parasitology, virology, biochemistry and pathology department laboratories are used for the definitive diagnosis of sick animals.

Necropsy and biopsy samples are also evaluated for diagnostic purposes. Research projects on farm animals are also carried out by clinical academicians. The examination materials within these research projects consist of samples taken for the diagnosis of sick animals. Students are also directly involved in these projects. Efforts are made for students to comprehend scientific experience and thinking. For this purpose, undergraduate and graduate students are involved in many BAP and TÜBİTAK projects in which healthy and diseased animal samples collected from different sources.

Students are encouraged to participate in national and international congresses. International student congresses are traditionally organized in our faculty (Annex 21). Students make presentations at these congresses. Some of the student graduation theses

prepared under the supervision of faculty members include topics based on clinical, laboratory or field research.

**2.3. Minor Deficiency 3:** Partial compliance with Substandard 4.7 because not all, but only volunteer students, can practise field veterinary medicine and Herd Health Management under academic supervision within the ambulatory clinic.

### **2.3.1. Factual Information**

In order to increase the quality and quantity of ambulatory clinical services, the number of equipment and personnel has been increased. Participation in ambulatory clinical services is compulsory for students who take Clinical III and Undergraduate Residency Training courses in the 9th and 10th semesters. The list of students taking these courses and the mobile clinic programme are discussed and decided by the Faculty Executive Board. Within the framework of the decision of the faculty board of directors, students are required to participate in mobile clinic activities in groups of 10-12 and participation is recorded.

With another project financially supported by the state, a horse-specific mobile clinic application has also been initiated (Annex 14.1). Technicians and support staff were provided to run the ambulatory clinical services.

**2.4. Minor Deficiency 4:** Partial compliance with substandard 4.9 because of sub-optimal delivery of biosafety and biosecurity in all departments.

### **2.4.1. Factual Information**

The number of biosafety commission members monitoring biosafety issues in FVMATAU was increased. "Biosafety Manual" was prepared by the Biosafety Commission and the Waste Management Plan was updated (Annex 8.1., 8.2., 8.3; see 1.3.1 Major Deficiencies). The biosafety guide and necessary explanations were published on the website.

Trainings on biosafety were organized for academic and administrative staff and students. Biosafety procedures applied in the clinics and laboratories of the relevant departments were determined and posted on the boards to be seen.

Care is taken to implement biosafety and biosecurity measures in all services and departments within FVMATAU. Students and staff are asked to follow biosafety procedures. Practices in this regard are notified directly to the staff by electronic correspondence.

**2.5. Minor Deficiency 5:** Partial compliance with Substandard 5.3 because not under all circumstances students are active participants in the clinical workup of patients.



### 2.5.1. Factual Information

As stated in the full visit report, students receive clinical training at the VTH, working in groups and on a rotational basis in surgery, internal medicine, obstetrics and gynaecology and reproduction (andrology) and artificial insemination. Services for small animals, large animals and exotic animals are available.

Every effort is made to ensure that all students participate in all clinical training and procedures with patients and gain further practical experience. In line with the "Principles of Applied Training", students are encouraged and monitored to participate in practices such as anamnesis taking, registration procedures and direct contact with the patient, diagnosis and treatment processes as well as follow-up (Annex 10).

In the clinics, patient follow-up forms were developed for students to follow the patients from the stage of taking anamnesis until discharge. In clinical courses, students enter the patient owner information, anamnesis information, analyses and tests requested for diagnosis, treatment/operation and prescription information on these forms. These forms are also uploaded to ÖBS by the student and the original document is submitted to the Faculty.

**2.6. Minor Deficiency 6:** Partial compliance with Substandard 7.2 because the number of students admitted is sub-optimally consistent with the resources available at the VEE for staff, buildings, equipment, healthy and diseased animals, and materials of animal origin.

### 2.6.1. Factual Information

The suggestions made to reduce the number of accepted students were approved by the Rectorate of the University. In this regard, which is a common problem of other faculties, initiatives were also taken before the Council of Deans of Veterinary Faculties and the Council of Higher Education. We constantly bring up the issue of acceptance of excessive number of students and consequent education quality. We will continue to do so. For the year 2024, it was decided to admit 70 students with the decision of the Faculty Board and this decision was approved by the University Senate and submitted to YÖK.

Care is taken to ensure that educational resources are used equally for all registered students. For this purpose, all classes were divided into sections (A, B) to reduce size of students in the education groups. In this way, higher quality theoretical and practical education was provided with smaller student groups.

**2.7. Minor Deficiency 7:** Partial compliance with Substandard 8.5 because of a sub-optimal implementation of Day One Competencies in the assessment of clinical skills.

### **2.7.1. Factual Information**

The deficiencies under this heading are explained in Major deficiencies 1.1.1. In our faculty, Practical Education Principles (Annex 10) for the practices (including clinical practices) of the courses taught in all disciplines were prepared (Annex 10) and put into practice in the spring semester of the 2021-2022 academic year (See 3.1.3.). As a result of this implementation; the activities to be carried out were formally defined and enlisted in the Practical Training Guidelines (Annex 7) practical training diary for each semester (14 weeks). In order to pass the quality control, the practices are tracked by the students digitally in ÖBS or manually through notebooks. All departments log the 14-week practice lists of these activities at the beginning of each semester and report them to the dean's office.

**2.8. Minor Deficiency 8:** Partial compliance with Substandard 9.3 because the balance of the workload of teaching, research and service and the rewarding system for teaching excellence are sub- optimal.

### **2.8.1. Factual Information**

There is an "Academic Incentive System" organized by YÖK for the scientific activities (publications, research projects, scientific awards, patents, citations, etc.) of academic staff. The remuneration equivalent to the academic performance score calculated each year is rewarded by adding to the monthly salary for 12 months. A big majority of faculty members at FVMATAU receive this incentive (Annex 22.1, 22.2, 22.3).

In addition, within the scope of "Scientific Incentive Awards" by Atatürk University, academic staff's publications in Q1 and Q2 journals, number of citations in Web of Science (WOS) and national/international external projects are rewarded with monetary awards with a achievement certificate (Annex 23).

The "Academic Incentive Award", which includes a) 713 parameters in seven layers in the multiplier of education, b) research and c) contribution to society / continuing education for sustainable knowledge and skill, is also given on the basis of annual academic performance. Our academic staff receive awards from all three award systems (Annex 24.1, 24.2, 24.3).

In addition, research assistant positions are allocated by the Rectorate as a reward for high performing faculty members. In this context, in 2023, in response to the high performance of the faculty members of the Departments of Pathology and Genetics, one research assistant was recruited to work with the relevant faculty members.



Since the number of academic staff has reached a sufficient number for each department, there is no imbalance in the workload. This success is indicated in the Time Higher Education (THE) reports that announced FVMATAU ranging top 1 in four-consecutive years among nationwide faculties (Annex 4).

In addition, in line with the recommendations in the full visit report, clinical activities were added to the score scale / positional promotion in the University Appointment Promotion Directive. With the arrangements made after the visit, academics who contribute to the revolving fund budget revenues, especially academics participating in clinical studies, started to be paid every month in proportion to their contribution.

In the event that faculty members teach more than the compulsory course hours, they are paid additional course fees on an hourly basis.

**2.9. Minor Deficiency 9:** Partial compliance with Substandard 9.4 because the program for professional growth and development of academic and support staff is sub-optimal.

### **2.9.1. Factual Information**

As stated in the Final Report, the promotion criteria for academic staff are clear for all staff. This criterion includes many sub-headings within the scope of education, training and contribution to society as well as research achievements. These issues are specified in detail in the Associate Professorship Regulation of the Council of Higher Education and Atatürk University Academic Staff Appointment-Promotion Directive.

As a result of the studies carried out at the Rectorate level in line with the comments and suggestions stated in 9.4. of the final report, the teaching performance of academic staff was included in the incentive and promotion process. As a result of the arrangements made in the Appointment-Promotion Directive, the clinical activities of academic staff were specifically included in the incentive and promotion process.

In addition, support is provided for short and long term domestic and international education and research activities of academic staff. In this context, 5 faculty members were assigned for education and research activities in Turkey and abroad (sabbatical) after the visit.

In order to increase the professional skills of graduate students and faculty members of our faculty, their participation in training programmes organized by the units affiliated to the Rectorate of Atatürk University is encouraged (Annex 25,26.1, 26.2). Trainings are also organized for the professional development of support staff.



We have made intensive efforts to eliminate and correct the deficiencies mentioned in the final report. As it is known, the COVID-19 outbreak during and after the visit was an important problem that prevented all kinds of work. Moreover, after the great earthquakes that occurred in our country on February 6, 2023, education and training was carried out online in the relevant spring semester (except for Undergraduate Residency Training). Despite all these negativities, distance education was successfully carried out with the strong digital infrastructure of our university.





# **ESEVT INDICATORS**



### 3. ESEVT INDICATORS

#### 3.1. Factual information (Updated data based on the last three academic years)

	Raw data from the 3 full academic years 2021-2023	2021	2022	2023	Mean
1	n° of FTE academic staff involved in veterinary training	83	80	88	83,67
2	n° of undergraduate students	519	548	583	550,00
3	n° of FTE veterinarians involved in veterinary training	74	72	80	75,33
4	n° of students graduating annually	88	75	74	79,00
5	n° of FTE support staff involved in veterinary training	43	50	48	47,00
6	n° of hours of practical (non-clinical) training	1158	1158	1158	1158,00
7	n° of hours of clinical training	1334	1334	1334	1334,00
8	n° of hours of FSQ & VPH training	314	314	314	314,00
9	n° of hours of extra-mural practical training in FSQ & VPH	94	94	94	94,00
10	n° of companion animal patients seen intra-murally	7109	7335	7291	7245,00
11	n° of ruminant and pig patients seen intra-murally	1403	848	1185	1145,33
12	n° of equine patients seen intra-murally	79	39	22	46,67
13	n° of rabbit, rodent, bird and exotic patients seen intra-murally	483	339	524	448,67
14	n° of companion animal patients seen extra-murally	3	1	105	36,33
15	n° of individual ruminants and pig patients seen extra-murally	429	418	1400	749,00
16	n° of equine patients seen extra-murally	1	1	230	77,33
17	n° of visits to ruminant and pig herds	270	266	245	260,33
18	n° of visits of poultry and farmed rabbit units	44	44	44	44,00
19	n° of companion animal necropsies	55	186	171	137,33
20	n° of ruminant and pig necropsies	141	74	97	104,00
21	n° of equine necropsies	3	3	6	4,00
22	n° of rabbit, rodent, bird and exotic pet necropsies	90	217	328	211,67
23	n° of FTE specialized veterinarians involved in veterinary training	57	62	67	62,00
24	n° of PhD graduating annually	4	15	14	11,00

Name of the Establishment:		Faculty of Veterinary Medicine, Atatürk University, Erzurum/Türkiye			
Date of the form filling:		10.02.2024			
Calculated Indicators from raw data		Establishment	Median	Minimal	Balance <sup>3</sup>
		values	values <sup>1</sup>	values <sup>2</sup>	
<b>I1</b>	n° of FTE academic staff involved in veterinary training / n° of undergraduate students	0,152	0,15	0,13	0,026
<b>I2</b>	n° of FTE veterinarians involved in veterinary training / n° of students graduating annually	0,954	0,84	0,63	0,324
<b>I3</b>	n° of FTE support staff involved in veterinary training / n° of students graduating annually	0,595	0,88	0,54	0,055
<b>I4</b>	n° of hours of practical (non-clinical) training	1158,000	953,50	700,59	457,410
<b>I5</b>	n° of hours of clinical training	1334,000	941,58	704,80	629,200
<b>I6</b>	n° of hours of FSQ & VPH training	314,000	293,50	191,80	122,200
<b>I7</b>	n° of hours of extra-mural practical training in FSQ & VPH	94,000	75,00	31,80	62,200
<b>I8</b>	n° of companion animal patients seen intra-murally / n° of students graduating annually	91,709	62,31	43,58	48,129
<b>I9</b>	n° of ruminant and pig patients seen intra-murally / n° of students graduating annually	14,498	2,49	0,89	13,608
<b>I10</b>	n° of equine patients seen intra-murally / n° of students graduating annually	0,591	4,16	1,53	-0,939
<b>I11</b>	n° of rabbit, rodent, bird and exotic seen intra-murally / n° of students graduating annually	5,679	3,11	1,16	4,519
<b>I12</b>	n° of companion animal patients seen extra-murally / n° of students graduating annually	0,460	5,06	0,43	0,030
<b>I13</b>	n° of individual ruminants and pig patients seen extra-murally / n° of students graduating annually	9,481	16,26	8,85	0,631
<b>I14</b>	n° of equine patients seen extra-murally / n° of students graduating annually	0,979	1,80	0,62	0,359
<b>I15</b>	n° of visits to ruminant and pig herds / n° of students graduating annually	3,312	1,29	0,54	2,772
<b>I16</b>	n° of visits of poultry and farmed rabbit units / n° of students graduating annually	0,557	0,11	0,04	0,512
<b>I17</b>	n° of companion animal necropsies / n° of students graduating annually	1,738	2,11	1,40	0,338
<b>I18</b>	n° of ruminant and pig necropsies / n° of students graduating annually	1,316	1,36	0,90	0,416
<b>I19</b>	n° of equine necropsies / n° of students graduating annually	0,051	0,18	0,10	-0,049
<b>I20</b>	n° of rabbit, rodent, bird and exotic pet necropsies / n° of students graduating annually	2,679	2,65	0,88	1,799
<b>I21*</b>	n° of FTE specialised veterinarians involved in veterinary training / n° of students graduating annually	0,785	0,27	0,06	0,725
<b>I22*</b>	n° of PhD graduating annually / n° of students graduating annually	0,139	0,15	0,07	0,069
<b>1</b>	Median values defined by data from Establishments with Accreditation/Approval status in May 2019				
<b>2</b>	Recommended minimal values calculated as the 20th percentile of data from Establishments with Accreditation/Approval status in May 2019				
<b>3</b>	A negative balance indicates that the Indicator is below the recommended minimal value				
<b>*</b>	Indicators used only for statistical purpose				

## **LIST OF ANNEXES**

- Annex 1** : VEDEK Accreditation Certificate
- Annex 2** : <https://atauni.edu.tr/en/aturk-universitesi-akreditasyonda-tarih-yazdi208-universite-arasinda-5-sirada-yer-aldi>
- Annex 3** : <https://atauni.edu.tr/aturk-universitesi-arastirma-universiteleri-grubunda-a2-kategorisine-yukseldi>
- Annex 4** : Times Higher Education Rankings
- Annex 5** : Commission List
- Annex 6** : Curriculum
- Annex 7** : Application Guidelines
- Annex 8.1** : Biosafety Documents (Biosafety Guide)
- Annex 8.2** : Biosafety Documents (Waste Management Plan)
- Annex 8.3** : Biosafety Documents (Student Laboratory Safety)
- Annex 9** : Day One Competences
- Annex 10** : Principles of Practical Trainings
- Annex 11** : Pathology Department Board Decision for Necropsy
- Annex 12** : Protocols
- Annex 13** : Hospital Appointment Letter
- Annex 14.1** : Equine Mobile Clinic Project
- Annex 14.2** : Ruminant Mobile Clinic Project
- Annex 15** : <https://birimler.atauni.edu.tr/veteriner-fakultesi/gezici-klinik/>
- Annex 16.1** : Sheep and Goat Farm Protocol
- Annex 16.2** : Poultry Farm Protocol
- Annex 17** : Appointment and promotion list of academic and technical personnel after the EAEVE visit
- Annex 18** : <https://birimler.atauni.edu.tr/veteriner-fakultesi/akademik-personel/>
- Annex 19** : Minimum Requirements for Veterinary Education
- Annex 20** : Higher Education Law No. 2547
- Annex 21** : <https://atavet2021.atauni.edu.tr/>

**Annex 22.1** : Academic Incentive Regulation

(<https://www.mevzuat.gov.tr/mevzuat?MevzuatNo=201811834&MevzuatTur=21&MevzuatTertip=5>)

**Annex 22.2** : Academic Incentive List (2021)

**Annex 22.3** : Academic Incentive List (2022)

**Annex 23** : University Academic Scientific Rewards

**Annex 24.1** : Seven Layer Reward System (2021 Academic Performance Evaluation Report)

**Annex 24.2** : Seven Layer Reward System (2023 Academic Performance Evaluation Report)

**Annex 24.3** : Seven Layer Reward System (University Academic Scientific Rewards)

**Annex 25** : ATASEM Continuing Education System: <https://atasem.atauni.edu.tr/>

**Annex 26.1** : Trainings on Experimental Animal Usage: <https://atasem.atauni.edu.tr/deney-hayvanlari-kullanim-sertifikasi-egitim-programi-xviii-fare-rat-ve-tavsan-icin/>

**Annex 26.2** : Training on Projects: <https://pdo.atauni.edu.tr/>



## ABBREVIATIONS

<b>BAP</b>	: Scientific Research Projects Coordination Unit
<b>DAP</b>	: Ministry of Industry and Technology, Eastern Anatolian Headquarter
<b>EAEVE</b>	: European Association of Establishments for Veterinary Education
<b>EPT</b>	: Extra-mural Practical Training
<b>ESEVT</b>	: European System of Evaluation of Veterinary Training
<b>E-VET</b>	: Automated Registration System
<b>FVMATAU</b>	: Faculty of Veterinary Medicine Atatürk University
<b>GHUAM</b>	: Food and Livestock Application and Research Center
<b>ÖBS</b>	: Student Information System
<b>SOP</b>	: Standard Operating Procedure
<b>TÜBİTAK</b>	: Scientific and Technological Research Council of Turkey.
<b>VEDEK</b>	: Association for Evaluation and Accreditation of Educational Institutions and Programs of Veterinary Medicine
<b>VUÇEP</b>	: Veterinary Medicine National Core Education Program
<b>VTH</b>	: Veterinary Teaching Hospital
<b>YÖK</b>	: Council of Higher Education
<b>YÖKAK</b>	: Higher Education Quality Board



